

Job Satisfaction among doctors working in Government and Private Hospitals-A Comparative study

¹ Parameshwaraiah P, ² Dr. B Bakkappa

¹ Research Scholar, Institute of Management Studies, Davengere University, Davangere, Karnataka, India.

² Director and Professor, Dept of MBA, G M Institute of Technology, Davangere, Karnataka, India.

Abstract

The study of job satisfaction is justified on the basis of its potential value of understanding and the generation of positive results from both the organizational and individual perspective. The understanding could be used in the elaboration of strategies for organizational human resources policies. The present study was conducted with hospital Doctors, since they are one of the most important stakeholders in hospitals to investigate the factors that influence their job satisfaction. Due to the globalization of the health sector, there are many opportunities, growth and performance of jobs for the doctors. The health sector is a service sector more focused on people, which is increasing rapidly in recent years. Ensuring the job satisfaction of doctors is important to retain doctors and provide health services successfully. This study is conducted to study general job satisfaction among doctors working in private hospitals and government hospitals in Karnataka. The objective is to improve the job satisfaction of doctors in their workplace and review the factors that influence their job satisfaction, such as financial benefits, other motivating factors such as recognition, independence, performance, opportunities for growth and development. They were positively linked to job satisfaction. The data were collected by the research method through a survey questionnaire and analyzed. From the study, it is evident that there is a significant link between the factors and the job satisfaction of the doctors, in addition to the general benefits and the package.

Key words: Job Satisfaction, Doctors, Factors affecting job satisfaction, Government and Private hospitals.

Job Satisfaction: Introduction, Definition and Importance

The present study is an attempt to understand the level of job satisfaction of the doctors of Government Hospitals and private hospitals in Karnataka. Its objective is to explore the factors that contribute to the job satisfaction of doctors. The study has collected data from selected hospitals in Karnataka. The analysis of the data revealed a significant association between the job satisfaction of the doctors and the key factors of job satisfaction namely, Staff relations, pay and remuneration or compensation, professional growth, patient care and balance in working life. The result indicates the importance of identifying job satisfaction factors that ultimately motivate them to do the job. There is a need for research regarding job satisfaction and related factors to explore the development of good human resources strategies in the context of the hospital. The investigation of doctors' job satisfaction, especially for health institutions such as hospitals, can make a significant contribution to a better understanding of the complex behavioral phenomena of Doctors.

Definitions:

According to **Locke** (1976), job satisfaction is a self-reported positive emotional state resulting from the appraisal of one's job or from job experiences. (1)

Sector (1997) considers job satisfaction as an attitudinal variable which reveals the extent to which individual likes his job, and is always positively correlated with job performance. (2)

Mullins (1999) highlights the factors influencing job satisfaction of workers as follows: -

- Individual factors such as personality, education, intelligence/ abilities, age, marital status, orientation to work and so on.
- Social factors such as relationship with staffs, team work and norms, opportunities for interaction and informal organization.
- Cultural factors such as underlying attitudes, beliefs and values.
- Organizational factors such as nature and size, formal structure, personnel policies and procedures, relationships with employees, nature of work, technology and work organization, supervision and leadership styles, management systems and working conditions

- Environmental factors such as economic, social, technical and governmental influences. (3)

Importance of Job Satisfaction studying in Health Care

According to the literature, job satisfaction in health care organizations is related to many factors: optimal work arrangements; the possibility of participating actively in the decision-making process; effective communication between staff and supervisors; and be able to freely express one's opinion. The collective resolution of problems and the attitude of management are also important for employee satisfaction. (4-6)

Hospital people have difficulty meeting the needs of patients, if their individual needs are not met, they feel dissatisfied. Therefore, hospital administrators have responsibilities with both staff and patients. Employee satisfactions and patient satisfactions are important from the point of view of the hospital. Patient satisfaction is one of the main quality outcomes in hospitals. Job satisfaction is important in the management of health care. Overall growth and job satisfaction are important factors in retaining long-term hospital employees. Therefore, job satisfaction has become necessary for motivation and dedication to work. Ensuring job satisfaction and motivation of hospital employees is important to provide health services effectively and to retain employees. In a hospital environment, it has been found that employee satisfaction is positively related to the quality of the service and patient satisfaction. Employees can directly manipulate patient satisfaction due to their interest and communication with patients. (7)

Objectives:

The Major objectives of the review are:

- To make comparative analysis of factors influencing job satisfaction in Government Hospitals and Private Hospitals in Karnataka
- To identify the factors influencing Job Satisfaction among Doctors in Government Hospitals and Private Hospitals in Karnataka.
- To analyze and compare the levels of Job Satisfaction among Doctors in Private Hospitals and Government Hospitals in terms of patient care, time pressure and staff relations.

Methodology:

Design of this study is a correlative. It is more of opinion survey to identify the various factors influencing the job satisfaction level among doctors of government and private hospitals in Karnataka. A Structured anonymous, self-administered questionnaire of 30 multiple choice questions were collected and analysed.

Statistical Tools:

In this study survey method and following statistical tools and techniques are used with help of SPSS based on the objectives of the study. Most of the researchers have used below tools while doing their research.

- T-Test.
- F Test
- Correlation analysis

Scope of the Study

The research study primarily focuses on the factors affecting on Job Satisfaction and an attempt to understand and analyse the various factors including in the Job Satisfaction and to find out the factors significantly affecting job satisfaction of the doctors. In this comparative study as a sample, the researcher has taken only registered doctors working in hospitals in Karnataka.

Data Collection

a. Primary Data: In this study, the primary data was collected through structured questionnaire which was framed by the researcher based on literature review and objectives. Questionnaire was collected through the primary data from 400 respondents.

b. Secondary Data: To understand the proper study and to facilitate, besides the primary data, the secondary data was also collected and referred through websites, books, articles, publication, etc.

Review Literature

Archana G. Nemmaniwar & Dr. Madhuri S. Deshpande (2016) have worked on job satisfaction among hospital employees through a review of literature. On the basis of previous literature review, it has been found that apart from monetary benefits other

motivational factors such as recognition, autonomy, achievement, opportunities for growth and development were positively correlated with job satisfaction (8)

Manorama Meinam, B.K. (2015) has worked on job satisfaction of doctors in government hospitals of Manipur and mentions that to bring about a sound relationship between doctors and patients, conclusively majority of the doctors have medium level of satisfaction with their job. The influence of socio-demographic characteristics of doctors is not associated with the job satisfaction level of doctors and type of hospitals. However, some doctors were discontent with the behaviour and attitude of patient parties. (9)

Mohammad Sayed A. & Akhtar N. (2014) studied the effects of the balance between perceived work life and job satisfaction on organizational commitment among health care employees in Uttar Pradesh. It was predicted that the balance between perceived work life promotes job satisfaction, which leads to long-term organizational commitment among employees. The results showed that the respondents have a moderate level of balance between work life, job satisfaction and organizational commitment. The author concludes that the balance between work life and job satisfaction are important to develop and improve organizational commitment among health workers (10)

Meenakshi Sharma, Sonu Goel, Sharad Kumar Singh, Raman Sharama and Promad K Gupta (2014) on their study on Determinants of Indian Physicians' satisfaction & dissatisfaction from their job, the pattern of high proportion of satisfaction of the Indian physicians reported was similar to the physicians' satisfaction working particularly in the developed countries. Average physicians' low satisfaction composite scores indicate that the expectation of Indian physicians from job providers is minimal. Nine components obtained in this study as important indicators for assessment of satisfaction/ dissatisfaction can be used not only by health service system but also by other industries for assessment of their professionals' job satisfaction.(11)

Ramesh Kumar Miryala, and Shailaja Thangella (2012) in their study on "Job Satisfaction among Doctors", In considering appropriate responses to factors that lead to doctors' job satisfaction, six perspectives were considered: (1) Human Resource Practices; (2) Personal Contentedness; (3) Work and Delegation; (4) Human Resources Policies, (5) Pride and Recreation Facilities; and (6) Retirement Benefits. The factor scores and the weighted means signal the importance attached to each of these factors by the respondents. The human resource practices factor has attracted high prominence, followed by the personal contentedness aspect. These perspectives may suggest the kind of human resources

management needed at hospitals for sustainable and higher quality care and, ultimately, job satisfaction among doctors. (12)

Shidaye R V, Divakar D S, Gourav Goel, Shidaye Rahul, (2011) has conducted a study on “Influence on job satisfaction in Indian anaesthesiologists; a cross section survey” and his study reveals that although job satisfaction level of Indian anaesthesiologists is quite high, still there is a need to set the, which would help reduce occupational stress and further improve efficiency and job satisfaction among anaesthesiologist. Authorities, e.g. Indian society of anaesthesiologists may urge large scale multicentre studies to lay down standards related to number of working hours per day and per week, number of night call duty per week, making proper assistant mandatory, preparing standard protocols and guidelines for aesthetic management of different clinical causes, providing medico legal protection etc. (13)

In a case study by Philp and Raju (2006) among doctors and nurses of a multi-specialty private hospital, it was found that doctors are highly satisfied with their jobs but nurses are just satisfied. However source wise analysis for job satisfaction of nurses revealed that they are not satisfied in salary which is one of the two most important sources out of the six considered in the study. (14)

Joshi (2001) in his study on Occupational level and job satisfaction: A comparative study of public and private sector organizations found that the extent of job satisfaction is not significantly higher in the private hospital than in public (government) hospital. He found significant difference in job satisfaction of managers, supervisors and worker in private sector. (15)

Liu, Wang and Lu (2010) in their study on clinic doctors, medico-technical workers and public health workers found that most staff considered their job to be of importance and got along well with their fellow workers. What they felt most dissatisfied with were work reward (i.e. welfare, pay, and promotion opportunity), working conditions, and sense of work achievements. They also discovered that some caregivers complained that the salary was too low, considering their experience and skill levels, which substantially hurt their work enthusiasm. (16)

Rosta and Gerber (2008) define job satisfaction as a multidimensional parameter, consisting of intrinsic factors, which include decision autonomy and recognition, and extrinsic factors, which includes wages and job security. A variety of personal characteristics have been found

to have significant effects on reports of job satisfaction including gender, race, age, marital status, children and education. (17)

Ogunrin, Ogunrin and Akerele (2007) assert that, with regard to quality in service delivery, the motivational status and job satisfaction of employees are more crucial than sheer statistics. Therefore, employees are the greatest assets and no matter how efficient an organization’s technology and equipment may be, it is no match for the effectiveness and efficiency of the employees.(18)

Marina Kaarna (2007) on his study “The importance of Job Satisfaction in hospital quality process”, he concludes that, the management of Parnu Hospital seems to have captured the commitment of the staff to the hospital, as indicated by predominately positive response to the items “Proud to be working in the hospital” and “willingness to make extra effort” , along with the predominately negative responses to the items “nothing here depends on me” and “my future that of the hospital are not and will not become compatible”. These four items were shown to be important to organizational commitment in the studies of American hospital staff by Luthans and sommers, most likely due to good relationships with their supervisors. However, there appears to be room for improvement in the satisfaction ratings of the staff at Parnu Hospital.(19)

Cumbey and Alexander (1998) have conducted a study on the relationship of job satisfaction with organization variable in public health Nursing, considered it as an effective feeling that depends on the interaction of employees, their personal characteristics, and expectations with the work environment, and the organization.(20)

Data Analysis and Interpretation

Reliability test results of Questionnaire

Table 1: Case Processing Summary

		N	%
Cases	Valid	30	100.0
	Excluded	0	.00
	Total	30	100.0

Table 2: Reliability Statistics

Cronbach’s Alpha	N no of items
0.898	60

Interpretation: Cronbach’s alpha is .89 which is greater than standard .80

Analysis report

Objectives 1: To make comparative analysis of factors influencing job satisfaction in Government Hospitals and Private Hospitals in Karnataka.

Hypothesis 1: H0: There is a significant difference between private hospital doctors and government hospital doctors in relation to job satisfaction factors

Table 3: Comparative Analysis between Govt. and Private Doctors

Parameters	Government Doctors	Private Doctors
Working hours	Satisfactory	Not Satisfactory
HR Practices & Policies	Satisfactory	Satisfactory
Recognition & Promotion	Not satisfactory	Satisfactory
Pay Band	Not satisfactory	Satisfactory
Work Life Balance	Satisfactory	Not Satisfactory
Personal Growth Opportunities	Not Satisfactory	Satisfactory

Interpretation: Govt. doctors are satisfied with working hours, HR practices, work life balance and Personal growth opportunities where as Pvt. Doctors are not satisfied with working hours and work life balance

Table 4: Major factors influencing Job Satisfaction among private doctors

Sl No	Factors influencing Job Satisfaction	Strongly Agree (5)	Agree (4)	Neutral (3)	Disagree (2)	Strongly Disagree (1)	Mean
01	Facilities & Environment	54	89	26	19	12	156.80
02	Working Conditions	46	77	56	14	7	154.20
03	Monetary Factors	33	69	67	19	12	144.40
04	Organizational System	33	68	40	47	12	138.06
05	Staff relations	33	103	33	26	5	152.60

06	Work life balance	40	54	40	47	19	135.80
07	Welfare Measures	33	33	68	54	12	130.20
08	Time Pressure	19	61	47	54	19	127.40
09	Patient Care	33	87	54	16	10	149.40

Interpretation: Mean scores of working conditions, facilities and staff relations significantly influence the job satisfaction. Time pressure, work life balance mean scores are low and they affecting the level of job satisfaction.

Table 5: Major factors influencing Job satisfaction among Govt. Doctors

Sl. No	Factors influencing Job Satisfaction	Strongly Agree (5)	Agree (4)	Neutral (3)	Disagree (2)	Strongly Disagree (1)	Mean
01	Facilities & Environment	40	110	19	19	12	155.40
02	Working Conditions	40	89	40	19	12	151.20
03	Monetary Factors	19	77	75	12	17	138.60
04	Organizational System	33	54	54	33	26	133.00
05	Staff relations	43	83	47	19	08	152.80
06	Work life balance	47	96	33	12	12	156.80
07	Welfare Measures	33	54	54	40	19	134.40
08	Time Pressure	19	61	75	40	5	135.80
09	Patient Care	38	103	40	19	0	159.60

Interpretation: Mean scores of patient care, working conditions and work life balance factors significantly influence job satisfaction. Organizational system, welfare measures and time pressure affecting the level of job satisfaction.

Objective 2: H1: To identify the factors influencing Job Satisfaction among Doctors in Government Hospitals and Private Hospitals in Karnataka.

Hypothesis 2: H0: There is a significant degree of difference in the perception of doctors about various factors

Table: 6 Factors (Means) influencing Job Satisfaction

Factors	Private doctors	Govt. Doctors
Facilities & Environment	156.80	155.40
Working Conditions	154.20	151.20
Economic Factors	144.40	138.60
Organizational System	138.6	133.00
Staff relations	152.60	152.80
Work life balance	135.80	156.80
Welfare Measures	130.20	134.60
Time Pressure	127.40	135.80
Patient Care	149.40	159.60

Interpretation: Means Scores of Facilities & Environment, Working Conditions, and Staff relations factors significantly influence job satisfaction in private doctors and Patient care, Work Life balance and facilities and environment factors are significantly influencing the level of job satisfaction among government doctors.

Objective 3: To analyze and compare the levels of Job Satisfaction among Doctors in Private Hospitals and Government Hospitals in terms of patient care, time pressure and staff relations

Hypothesis 4: There is a relationship between Job Satisfaction and Staff relations.

Table: 7, Staff relations, Time Pressure, Patient Care and Job Satisfaction

SI No	Factors	Private Doctors	Govt Doctors
1	Staff relations	152.60	152.80
2	Time Pressure	127.40	135.80
3	Patient Care	149.40	159.60

Interpretation: Above analysis shows that government doctors have given the opinion that patient care is a significant factor which influences job satisfaction in comparison to private doctors. Private Doctors and government doctors have given the same opinion that staff relations significant factor that influences job satisfaction.

The Government Doctors have given opinion that Time Pressure is a significant factor which influences Job Satisfaction in comparison to private doctors.

Table 8: F Test

Factors	Private doctors	Rank	Govt Doctors	Rank
Facilities & Environment	156.8	1	155.4	3
Working Conditions	154.2	2	151.2	5
Monetary Factors	144.4	5	138.6	6
Organizational System	138.6	6	133	9
Staff relations	152.6	3	152.8	4
Work life balance	135.8	7	156.8	2
Welfare Measures	130.2	8	134.6	7
Time Pressure	127.4	9	135.8	8
Patient Care	149.4	4	159.6	1

F calculated value - 0.96 @ 5% level of significance

F table value – 5.3177 (1, 8 degrees of freedom)

F table value is greater than F calculated value-

Interpretation: There is a significance of difference between variances of perception mean squares of private and public doctors.

Table: 10 Rank correlations co-efficient

Factors	Private Hospital-Rank	Govt. Hospital Rank
Facilities & Environment	1	3
Working Conditions	2	5
Economic Factors	5	6
Organizational System	6	9
Staff relations	3	4
Work life balance	7	2
Welfare Measures	8	8
Time Pressure	9	7
Patient Care	4	1

R= 0.52 (Positively correlated)

Ranks between Private and Public doctors ranking is correlated to some extent their degree of correlation is only about 52%.

Interpretation

For private doctors Facilities & Environment, Working Conditions and Staff relations are top three factors whereas Patient Care, Work life balance and Facilities & Environment top three factors for Govt. Doctors.

Further Study

There were many gaps in the literature regarding the sample size, the population and the tools used to evaluate these factors that affect job satisfaction. Therefore, more large-scale, uniform studies are needed in this area to explore job satisfaction among doctors, especially in rural hospitals, where the doctor's availability is more essential to take care of patients.

Major Findings:

- Most of the Private Doctors significantly satisfied with the Facilities & Working environment available.
- Patient Care is the most satisfaction factor to many of the government doctors.
- Government doctors were most satisfied than private doctors in terms of economic factors
- Health care standards were partially satisfied to both government and private doctors
- Staff relations was poor with respect to both government and private doctors
- Private Doctors were able to balance work life satisfactorily
- Both government and private doctors were involved in time pressure situations
- Welfare measures were satisfactory to both government and private doctors

Suggestions:

It is very important to consider the monetary and growth benefits for the government Doctors. It is essential to consider these factors in order to attract more and more MBBS students to the government sector.

Private hospitals must draw a line between professional life and personal life; Doctors should be motivated by providing flexible work schedules.

Conclusion:

Although more than half of the study population of Doctors' was satisfied with their current work, it is quite true that some areas were commonly associated with dissatisfaction; The review of the literature indicates that there are many factors that contribute to the job satisfaction of the Doctors. According to the literature review, not only salary, incentives, working conditions are important predictive factors, but also other intrinsic factors such as achievement, recognition, responsibility and the opportunity for personal growth, are also important for job satisfaction. These factors resemble Herzberg's motivators in the two-factor theory and Maslow's needs for self-esteem and esteem in the needs hierarchy. Place of work and income being the main candidates. This should generate concern on the part of those responsible for formulating policies, since they seem to be in critical areas of patient care.

REFERENCES

- 1. Locke, E. A. (1976).** “The nature and causes of Job Satisfaction”. In M.D. Dunnette (Ed.), Handbook of Industrial and Organizational Psychology (pp 1297-1343). Chicago: Rand McNally.
- 2. Spector, P.E. (1997).** “Job satisfaction: Application, assessment, causes and consequences, SAGE, London.
- 3. Mullins L. (1999).** “Management and Organizational Behaviour”. 5th Ed. London: Person Education
- 4. Love JE Jr (1977)** A study of the relationships between perceived organizational stratification, and individual job satisfaction and adaptiveness in hospital laboratories. Am J Med Technol. 1977;43:1135. [[PubMed](#)]
- 5. Freeborn DK, Hooker RS.** “Satisfaction of physician assistants and other non physician providers in a managed care setting”. Public Health Rep. 1995; 110:714–9. [[PMC free article](#)] [[PubMed](#)]
- 6. Herzberg F, Mausner B, Snyderman BB.** “The motivation of work” 2nd Ed. New York: John Wiley and Sons; 1963..
- 7. Kaarna, M. (2007).** “The importance of job satisfaction in hospital quality process”. Master of Public Health. NHV: Nordic School of Public.
- 8. Archana G. Nemmaniwar & Dr. Madhuri S. Deshpande (2016),** “Job Satisfaction among hospital employees”, IOSR-Journal of Business Management, e-ISSN:2278-487X, p-ISSN:2319-7668, Volume 18, Issue 6, Ver.III, pp-27-31
- 9. Manorama Meinam, & B.K. Behera (2015),** “Job Satisfaction of Doctors in Government Hospitals of Manipur: A Sociological Study”, IOSR Journal of Humanities and Social Science, Vol: 20, Issue 5, Ver: III, e-ISSN: 2279-0837, p-ISSN: 2279-0845, pp: 22-24
- 10. Mohammad Syed A, & Akhtar N (2014).** “The Influence of Work Life Balance and Job Satisfaction on Organizational Commitment of Health care Employees.” International Journal of Human Resource Studies, ISSN 2162-3058, 4(2), 18–24.
- 11. Meenakshi Sharma, Sonu Goel, Sharad Kumar Singh, Raman Sharama and Promad K Gupta (2014)** “Determinants of Indian Physicians’ satisfaction & dissatisfaction from their job”, Indian J Med Res, 139, PP 409-417
- 12. Ramesh Kumar Miryala, and Shailaja Thangella (2012)** “Job Satisfaction among Doctors”, the UIP Journal of Management Research, Vol. 11, No.3, PP 1-18.
- 13. Shidaye R V, Divakar D S, Gourav Goel, Shidaye Rahul, (2011)** “Influence on job satisfaction in Indian anaesthesiologists; a cross section survey”, Anaesth, pain and incentive care 2011:15(1) PP 36
- 14. Philp, I., & Raju, G. (2006).** “Job satisfaction in health care industry: A case study”. The Journal of Busines Studies, 3 (5), 7-12.
- 15. Joshi, G.(2001)** Occupational level and job satisfaction: “A comparative study of publican d private sector organizations”. Journal of the Indian Academy of Applied Psychology, Volume 27 (1-2), PP 157; 161.
- 16. Liu, J.A., Wang, Q. & Lu, Z.X. (2010).** Job satisfaction and its modeling among township health centre employees: a quantitative study in poor rural China. BMC Health Services Research, 10, pp. 115.
- 17. Rosta, J. & Gerber, A. (2008).** Job satisfaction of hospital doctors. Results of a study of a national sample of hospital doctors in Germany. Gesundheitswesen, 70(89):519-524.
- 18. Ogunrin, F.O., Ogunrin, O.O., & Akerele, A. (2007).** Motivating Nigerian doctors for improved healthcare delivery. International Journal of Healthcare Quality Assurance, 2 (4), pp. 290-306.

19. **Marina Kaarna, (2007)**, “The Importance of Job Satisfaction in hospital quality process”, Nordic School of Public Health, ISBN 978-91-85721-04-7.
20. **Cumber D. Alexander J. (1998)** “The Relationship of job satisfaction with organization variable in public health Nursing”. JONA; Volume 28, PP 39-46